Public Records: Tackling the Tough Questions
Including Use of Smart Phones
and Other Thorny Issues

MRSC Local Government Webinar Series
November 13, 2012
Co-Presented By:
Joe Levan, MRSC Legal Consultant
Scott Sackett, Washington State Archives
Electronic Records Management Consultant
Webinar Technical Notes

During the Webinar:

• Technical Difficulties: Call MRSC at (206) 625-1300 or (800) 933-6772

• To expand or collapse your toolbar, click on the arrow

• To submit a question or comment:
  Maximize the “Questions” portion, type your message, and click the “Send” button

After the Webinar:

• A link to this webinar will be emailed to attendees
MRSC provides legal and policy assistance to cities, towns, counties, and other local governments throughout the state.

Call on Joe and the other MRSC consultants with questions related to municipal law and for assistance with sample policies and other research.

JOE LEVAN
Legal Consultant
jlevan@mrsc.org
(206) 625-1300
(800) 933-6772

www.mrsc.org

Municipal Research & Services Center of Washington
Washington State Archives, a division of the Office of the Secretary of State, preserves and provides access to state and local agency records with enduring historical value.

The Archives’ Records Management program provides guidance, advice and support to state and local government agencies in the retention and management of public records.

www.sos.wa.gov/archives/recordsmanagement

SCOTT SACKETT
Electronic Records Management Consultant
Scott.sackett@sos.wa.gov
(509) 413-3296
WHAT IS A PUBLIC RECORD UNDER CHAPTER 40.14 RCW?

For retention purposes (RCW 40.14.010):

• “...Made by or received by any agency of the state of Washington in connection with the transaction of public business...” (this applies to local governments as well as state agencies)
• “regardless of physical form or characteristics, and including such copies thereof...”
WHAT IS A PUBLIC RECORD UNDER CHAPTER 42.56 RCW?

For Public Records Act (PRA) purposes:

• Cities, counties, special purpose districts, and other local government entities are “local agencies” under the PRA
• Under the PRA, a “public record” is defined broadly to include any:
  ➢ Writing
  ➢ Containing information relating to the conduct of government
  ➢ That is prepared, owned, used, or retained by that government regardless of physical form or characteristics

RCW 42.56.010(1)
RCW 42.56.010(3)
**What records need to be retained? (What if they aren’t?)**

- Per RCW [40.14.070](#), public records can only be destroyed in accordance with [records retention schedules](#) approved by the Local Records Committee.
- If a record is destroyed prior to meeting its retention requirement, consequences can include:
  - Audit findings
  - Negative publicity
  - Lost lawsuits
  - Penal provisions under chapter [40.16](#) RCW (injury to and misappropriation of a public record)
KEEP YOURSELF OUT OF THE HEADLINES
INTENTIONAL DESTRUCTION OF A PUBLIC RECORD IS A FELONY UNDER CHAPTER 40.16 RCW

According to an October 2012 article in The Columbian newspaper:
• A former county auditor in Washington state was accused of shredding public records
• He was charged initially with two felony counts of injury to public records
• He admitted to asking his staff to shred documents, which included vouchers related to unauthorized personal expenses
• He ended up pleading guilty to attempted injury of public records, and he was sentenced to serve 168 hours of community service and ordered to pay the county $62,000 in restitution
Penalties under the PRA

- Requesters can sue the agency
- Statutory penalties – if the agency is found to have improperly denied the requester’s right to inspect or copy public records, courts have interpreted RCW 42.56.550(4) to mandate a per day penalty
- Depending upon the circumstances and the extent to which the agency acted in good faith, the penalty ranges from $0 per day up to $100 per day for each day the requester was denied the right to inspect or copy the public record at issue
- Costs and reasonable attorney fees may also be awarded against an agency if a requester can show that an agency denied the requester’s right to:
  - Inspect or copy a record, or
  - Receive a response to a PRA request in a reasonable time
No Duty to Create Records but once record exists, duty to retain may apply

• Neither the records retention requirements nor the PRA require an agency to create records
• If, for example, a PRA request is made for a record that no longer exists because it was properly destroyed in accordance with the appropriate records retention schedule, the response from the agency would be that there are no records responsive to the PRA request – see, e.g., Bldg. Indus. Ass'n of Wash. v. McCarthy, 152 Wn. App. 720 (2009)
• However, once a PRA request is made and while it is pending, records responsive to the request cannot be deleted, even if they could have been deleted otherwise under the applicable retention schedule – see, e.g., O'Neill v. City of Shoreline, 170 Wn.2d 138, 149 (2010); see also RCW 42.56.100
ELECTRONIC RECORDS & THE PRA

• An electronic record (just like any other record) will be a public record if it contains information related to the conduct of government and it has been prepared, owned, used, or retained by the agency

See also:
WAC 44-14-050 (processing of PRA requests – electronic records)
WAC 434-662-150 (email management)
WAC 44-14-05001 (access to electronic records)
WAC 44-14-05002 (reasonably locatable and translatable electronic records)
WAC 44-14-05003 (parties should confer on technical issues)
Metadata & the PRA

- Metadata is data about data
- Hidden statistical information about a document generated by a software program
- Generally not visible when a document is printed or converted to an image file
- Describes the history, tracking, or management of an electronic document
- Generally describes how, when, and by whom the record was collected, created, accessed, or modified and how it is formatted (e.g., size, location, storage requirements, and media information)

Examples of email metadata (among 1,200 or more properties):
- dates the email was sent, received, replied to, or forwarded
- blind carbon copy information
- sender address book information

**KEY CONCEPT – CONTENT**

**Content**

- In connection with the transaction of public business under chapter [40.14](#) RCW
- Relating to the conduct of government under chapter [42.56](#) RCW
- But Note: If the content of the record relates solely to personal matters and not agency business, it is not a public record – see, e.g., *Tiberino v. Spokane County Prosecutor*, 103 Wn. App. 680 (2000); *Yacobellis v. Bellingham*, 55 Wn. App. 706 (1989)
**Key Concept – Function/Use**

**Function/Use**

- Under the PRA, chapter 42.56 RCW, to constitute a record, the record must relate to the conduct of government and be either prepared, owned, used, or retained by the agency.
- Whether the record was *used* by the agency is not always clear.
- A record is “used” by an agency if the record contains information that the agency either employs for, applies to, or makes instrumental to a governmental end or purpose – see, *Concerned Ratepayers v. PUD No. 1*, 138 Wn.2d 950, 960 (1999).
Function/Use & Nexus

- Note: Even if a record relates in some way to the conduct of government, it may not be a public record if there is no nexus between the record and the agency’s decision-making process – see, e.g., *West v. Thurston County*, 168 Wn. App. 162 (2012) (attorney billing records not public records in a situation in which the invoices at issue were above the county’s deductible and the county did not receive or use the invoices); see also MRSC Insight post entitled, “Recent Court Guidance on What Constitutes a Public Record under the Public Records Act”

- Nexus occurs when a record not only relates to the conduct or performance of the agency, but also when the record is a relevant factor in the agency’s action – see, e.g., *Concerned Ratepayers v. PUD No. 1*, 138 Wn.2d 950 (1999)
KEY RECORDS RETENTION CONCEPT
PRIMARY VS. SECONDARY COPIES

Primary Copy
• Generally, is the original record sent or received
• Serves as the official record
• Must be retained in accordance with current retention schedules

Secondary Copy
• Copies/duplicates of primary records which may be discarded when no longer needed for agency business
IS IT A PUBLIC RECORD?

Retention Considerations:

1. **Not a public record** = not connected to transaction of public business - **no retention required**

Examples:

• Personal email to friend/family
• Facebook post to personal page, not relating to agency business
• But … records of such records may constitute public records (e.g., transaction log)
What is not a public record under the PRA?


- The court explained that personal notes, telephone messages, and daily appointment calendars are not public records.
- Why? Because such records:
  - Are generally created solely for the individual’s convenience or to refresh the writer’s memory.
  - Are maintained in a way indicating a private purpose.
  - Are not circulated or intended for distribution within agency channels.
  - Are not under agency control, and
  - May be discarded at the writer’s sole discretion.
**Records with Minimal Retention Value**

Retention Considerations:

2. **Is a record, but minimal retention value** – can destroy as soon as no longer needed for agency business

   a. Secondary copies (e.g., reference/convenience/access copies, cc’s, etc.)

   b. Transitory records:
      - Only document information of short-term value, AND
      - Not needed as evidence of a business transaction, AND
      - Not covered by a specific record series
Transitory Records

Retention Considerations:

Examples of transitory records:

• Community affairs notices (e.g. “Combined Fund Drive luncheon is this afternoon!”)
• Preliminary drafts, in many cases (see Advice Sheet)
• Metadata created on personal devices when remotely accessing records on agency server
Records with Retention Value

Retention Considerations:

3. Is a record, has retention value – must be retained for specified minimum retention period

Examples:

• Public Disclosure/Records Requests, GS2010-014 (retain for 2 years after request fulfilled, then destroy)
• Work Orders, GS50-06B-13 (retain for 3 years, then destroy)
• Communications – Governing/Executive/Advisory, GS50-01-12 (retain for 2 years after received/provided, then arrange for Archives appraisal/transfer)
**Process for Responding to PRA Requests**

1. Does an identifiable record exist that is responsive to the PRA request?
2. If yes, is there information in the record that is exempt or prohibited from disclosure?
3. If yes, the exempt information can be redacted and/or the information prohibited from disclosure cannot be disclosed.

**NOTE:** If the record is requested in electronic format, the general rule is that it is to be provided in electronic format.

- Keep in mind that WAC 434-662-040 requires that electronic records be retained in electronic format.
**SCENARIO 1:**

You begin your day by checking your agency email on your personal smart phone.
SCENARIO 1: ACCESSING AGENCY EMAIL VIA SMART PHONE – RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS

• **Content** and **function** determine retention
• Smart phone provides a means of remote access to agency email server
• Retain emails sent/received by agency email server as primary copy
• Flash memory/metadata created on your device is a transitory record
• Have policy: if it relates to agency business, use agency-controlled email account
Scenario 1: Accessing agency email via smart phone – PRA Considerations

- If you download an attachment from an email to view via your personal smart phone, it seems that the record likely will remain in temporary cache and be a secondary copy.
- Arguably, it would not be reasonable nor technically feasible to make such temporary cache available in response to a PRA request – see, e.g., *Mechling v. City of Monroe*, 152 Wn. App. 830 (2009), rev. den., 169 Wn.2d 1007 (2010); citing: WAC 44-14-050; WAC 44-14-05001
- If you don’t create unique agency records on your smart phone, the reasonable conclusion is that everything on the phone related to agency business would be a secondary copy.
Sample Email Policy

Monroe: Email for Public Officials, Policy & Guidelines

- Non-city email addresses may be disclosed in the course of responding to public records requests or discovery requests in legal proceedings – see http://www.mrsc.org/policyprocedures/m67email.pdf
What About Text Messages?

- Text messages can be problematic both from a records retention and PRA perspective.
- If you text, you are creating a unique record.
- Issues arise regarding who has custody and control of the record, and how to access such records because they are held by a third party.
- It may be, for example, that the third party provider will only retain texts for a limited amount of time (e.g., 5-10 days).
- If allowing texting, strongly recommend use of capture tools to retain all texts.
- If texting used to conduct agency business, recommend that it be limited to those for whom it is truly necessary (e.g., for specified law enforcement and emergency management functions).
SCENARIO 2:

You check your agency voice mail on your smart phone
SCENARIO 2: ACCESSING AGENCY VOICE MAIL VIA SMART PHONE – RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS

- Third party provider – presents challenges
- Again, content and function determine retention
- Is message transitory in nature (e.g., “call me at 2 PM”)?
- If message has retention value, capture record or, if not possible, memorialize it
SCENARIO 2: ACCESSING AGENCY VOICE MAIL VIA SMART PHONE – RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS (CONT.)

- If possible, capture voice mail within agency systems, e.g., as an email with audio file attached – retain what is captured as primary copy
- Not possible? Memorialize the business transacted, e.g., with an email to sender of the voice mail summarizing and confirming its content
- Again, agency policies/procedures regarding appropriate use and retention are recommended
Scenario 2: Accessing agency voice mail via smart phone – PRA Considerations

- Recommend having an integrated voice mail and email system so all voice messages also are created as files that become part of email system
- That way, the email with the voice message attachment is retained as the primary copy and the message on the voice mail system is a secondary copy that can be deleted
- Remember: Sound retention practices make it easier to respond to PRA requests
Sample Policy

Maple Valley: Telephone and Cellular Phone Usage Policy –
http://www.mrsc.org/policyprocedures/m355cellphonepol.pdf
**SCENARIO 3:**

You access your agency desktop or email via your personal laptop.
SCENARIO 3: ACCESSING AGENCY DESKTOP/EMAIL USING YOUR PERSONAL LAPTOP

RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS

• Whether accessing via Virtual Private Network (VPN) or remotely accessing email server, laptop serves as an access window to agency server/network
• Records on agency server/network are primary copy – retain based on content and function
• Flash memory/metadata created on your laptop is a transitory record
WHAT IF I’M USING A PERSONAL EMAIL ACCOUNT?

Retention Considerations:

• Should be avoided when conducting agency business – this should be reflected in agency policy
• If you must send from a non-agency account, copy to agency email address at same time and retain that as primary copy
• If you receive a business-related email on a personal account, forward to agency email address and retain that as primary copy
• If business needs to be conducted remotely, agency should have email that permits remote access and is accessible by agency
SCENARIO 3: ACCESSING AGENCY DESKTOP/EMAIL USING YOUR PERSONAL LAPTOP

PRA CONSIDERATIONS

• Seems reasonable to regard a VPN system as a method to gain access – a viewer
• Likely inadvisable to download documents to your personal laptop while using a VPN or remotely accessing your agency email
• If the document is the primary copy, reasonable approach would be to transfer it to the agency server and delete it from your personal laptop so the primary copy is on the agency server
• Don’t keep any primary copies of agency records on your personal electronic devices
SCENARIO 4:

Use of Social Media by you personally and/or on behalf of your agency
SCENARIO 4: SOCIAL MEDIA—RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS

- E.g., Facebook, Twitter, Flickr, LinkedIn, etc.
- Advice sheet available regarding key questions
- Best practices and guidelines from Office of the Governor
- Retention requirements based on content and function
- Records with retention value need to be captured and retained by agency
  - Most often entails third-party social media capture tools, e.g., TweetTake, SocialSafe, ArchiveFacebook, PageFreezer, etc.
  - Cannot rely on social media provider to retain – might be there in 10 years or might be gone tomorrow
SCENARIO 4: SOCIAL MEDIA – RETENTION CONSIDERATIONS

• Agency should have social media policy delineating terms of use, authorization/training required

Examples:
  • City of Seattle
  • City of Bonney Lake
  • City of Cheney

• Even if use not authorized, agency may be held accountable for elected officials/employees acting in official capacity on social media – advise capture and retention by agency
**Scenario 4: Social Media—PRA Considerations**

If the agency has its own Facebook page:

- Assume posts are public records
- Need to manage posts
- Consider retention
- Consider metadata
  - Maintained by a third party (e.g., Facebook)
  - Arguably, such metadata is not reasonably accessible
  - Use third party tools to capture records
SCENARIO 4: SOCIAL MEDIA–PRA CONSIDERATIONS (CONT.)

If an agency official or employee has his/her own Facebook page:

• Don’t mix agency business with your personal life
• In other words, don’t use your personal Facebook page to conduct agency business
• The agency should have clear and enforceable policies regarding such activities
• If you are an incumbent who is a candidate, make sure your election activities don’t mix with agency business
Additional Sample Policy

King County Social Media Guidelines

• Communication through agency-related social media is considered a public record – http://www.mrsc.org/policyprocedures/k5socmedguide.pdf
Moving to the Cloud? 
Retention Considerations

• Legal custody of the records
• Privacy, security; hijacking of information
• Data transmission/flow (where is the server, exactly?)
• Disaster preparedness and recovery
• If/when the business relationship ends, how will they ensure that your records can be exported in a usable, compatible format?
• These issues should be addressed in any contract/agreement with the provider
THE DIGITAL ARCHIVES: MOVING YOUR E-RECORDS INTO THE FUTURE

• Electronic records that are designated as Archival in retention schedules can be appraised and/or transferred to the Archives for permanent preservation and access
• **Digital Archives** currently holds >110 million records, over 36 million of which are searchable
• Current holdings include County Auditors’ recorded documents; Superior Court Clerk case files; scanned minutes, ordinances, and resolutions; emails with archival value; digital audio recordings of council/commission meetings, and more
QUESTIONS?

CONTACT INFORMATION

JOE LEVAN
MRSC Legal Consultant
jlevan@mrsc.org
(206) 625-1300
(800) 933-6772
www.mrsc.org

SCOTT SACKETT
Washington State Archives – Records Management
recordsmanagement@sos.wa.gov
scott.sackett@sos.wa.gov
(360) 586-4901
(509) 413-3296
www.sos.wa.gov/archives/recordsmanagement